

PART 6: Development Presentations**Item 5.1****1 DETAILS OF THE DEVELOPMENT**

Ref: 17/05999/PRE
Location: Crystal Palace Football Club, Whitehorse Lane, South Norwood, London
Ward: Selhurst
Description: Alterations and extensions to the existing stadium, and in particular to increase seating capacity of the Main Stand by 8,000 additional seats and increase internal floor space beneath the stand by 20,000sqm.
Applicant: Crystal Palace Football Club Ltd
Agent: Martin Robeson Planning Practice
Case Officer: Matt Duigan

2 BACKGROUND

- 2.1 This proposed development is being reported to Planning Committee to enable Members to view it at an early stage and to comment upon it. The development does not constitute an application for planning permission and any comments made upon it are provisional and subject to full consideration of any subsequent application and the comments received as a result of consultation, publicity and notification.
- 2.2 It should be noted that this report represents a snapshot in time, with negotiations and dialogue on-going. The plans and information provided to date are indicative only and as such the depth of analysis provided corresponds with the scope of information made available to Council officers. Other issues may arise as more detail is provided and the depth of analysis expanded upon.
- 2.3 The report covers the following:
1. Location detail, planning history and the proposal
 2. The principle of the development (including loss of housing)
 3. The impact on highway and parking conditions in the locality
 4. The appearance of the development and impact on the townscape
 5. The impact on nearby occupiers
 6. Other planning matters
 7. Specific Feedback Requested

3 LOCATION DETAILS, PLANNING HISTORY AND THE PROPOSAL**Site and surroundings**

- 3.1 The application site is Selhurst Park Football Stadium, Crystal Palace Football Club's (CPFC) home ground since 1924. The site is bounded to the north-west by Whitehorse Lane, to the north-east by Park Road and Holmesdale Road to the south-east.
- 3.2 The site is within Selhurst Ward and is approximately 600m from Selhurst Station, 615m from Norwood Junction Station and 900m from Thornton Heath Station. Public Transport Access Level (PTAL) varies across the site and ranges between 2 and 5 (on

a scale of 1 to 6, where 6 is the most accessible). Overall, given the proximity to rail stations, the site is considered to be reasonably well served by public transport.

3.3 The area is predominantly residential in character, although within the site itself and in addition to the stadium, there is a Sainsbury's supermarket, a number of small shop units and a night club (above the supermarket). Adjoining the supermarket to the north-west are residential flats fronting onto Whitehorse Lane.

Relevant Background

3.4 The current match day capacity of Selhurst Park is approximately 26,000 and seats for competitive matches are regularly sold out. The ticket allocation/profile of the spectators regularly attending a football match consist of mostly general admission (season ticket holders/club members) followed by hospitality and visiting supporters.

3.5 The existing stadium has four stands that surround the pitch, namely the 'Main Stand' which adjoins the Club car park and fan zone, the Holmesdale Road Stand (adjoining Holmesdale Road and featuring a distinctive curved roof) the Arthur Waite Stand (adjoining Park Road and accommodating away fans) and the Whitehorse Lane Stand.



3.6 All the stands were built at different times; the oldest stand being the Main Stand, which originally opened in 1924. New seats were installed in the Main Stand during the summer of 2013, player change facilities, restaurant, lounge and bar facilities are also within the stand.

Stand	Current seating capacity
Main Stand	6,163
Holmesdale Road Stand	8,147

Arthur Wait Stand	9,754
Whitehorse Land Stand	2,245 + seating in 24 executive boxes

- 3.7 During the 2015-2016 season there were 22 first team home games played at Selhurst Park with 21 games played during the 2016-2017 season. Of those games played, 15 were played at weekends with the remainder on week nights. While it is noted that additional fixtures are played at the ground, these are not as well attended as the games played by the Club's first team.
- 3.8 On match-days, a temporary road closure is put in place on Park Road, Holmesdale Road and Clifton Road. The road closures are operative during and for a period before and after each home game, and implemented by way of a Traffic Management Order (TMO). Sainsbury's is also temporarily closed during home fixtures.

Relevant planning history

- 3.11 The following planning decisions are relevant to the proposal:

77/20/997 dated 19/12/1977 approved the Whitehorse Lane end redevelopment to create 26 flats and a retail supermarket, with ancillary facilities, alterations to vehicular access and car park and replacement of some of the football stadium facilities.

A number of conditions are imposed on the consent to ensure the supermarket isn't open to the public in the 3 hours before or after football matches, and to ensure the car parking areas are appropriately controlled on match and non-match days.

This planning history is relevant in that the Main Stand would be expanded over a part of the Sainsbury's car park and the Club's car park.

86/01940/P dated 17/3/1987 approved an application for the erection of 16 x 3 bed houses and 16 x 4 bed houses along Holmesdale Road and Clifton Road.

It is of note that the approved plans show that 4 of the houses described as being located along Holmesdale Road, are actually approved to be built to the west of Holmesdale Road (fronting onto Wooderson Close and backing onto the access-way into the Club's car park from Holmesdale Road).

87/3645/P dated 29/3/1988 approved the erection of 12 x 3 bedroom and 16 x 4 bedroom houses along Holmesdale Road and Clifton Road.

It is worth highlighting that while a differing number of dwellings is approved in this scheme (when compared to the scheme approved in 86/01940/P) the approved plans are identical in relation to the housing to be built along Holmesdale Road (including the 4 houses approved to be built to the west of Holmesdale Road, fronting onto Wooderson Close and backing onto the accessway into the Club Car park).

These planning permissions (i.e. 86/01940/P and 87/3645/P) are relevant in that the expanded Main Stand would encroach onto housing land and result in the need to demolish some existing housing in Wooderson Close.

Proposal

- 3.9 The proposal is currently for:
- Demolition of some of the houses in Wooderson Close and loss of car parking spaces (in both the Club and Sainbury's car park);
 - A new extension to the Main Stand to create a three tier structure. The enlarged stand would increase to be 41 metres in height and accommodate an additional 8,000 seats;
 - Improved hospitality and entertainment facilities;
 - A new Football Club Museum.
- 3.10 Externally, the design of the stadium would not follow the standard rectangular box design, typical of many existing football stadiums in the UK. The extensions to the Main Stand would extend in a semi-circular form to join the ends of the Whitehorse Lane and Holmesdale Road stands. The design of the façade features extensive areas of glazing with a central vaulted arch (referencing the iconic 1851 Crystal Palace Exhibition Hall) with the Club's Eagle crest and Eagle wings flanking the proposed 41-metre high structure.

4 PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS

- 4.1 The main planning issues raised by the development that the committee should be aware of are:
- The principle of the development (including loss of housing)
 - The impact on highway and parking conditions in the locality
 - The appearance of the development and impact on the townscape
 - The impact on nearby occupiers
 - Other planning matters

The Principle of the Development (including loss of Housing)

Loss of housing and car parking spaces

- 4.2 The expansion of the Main Stand will involve displacement of land which is currently used for car parking and housing. Some of the houses towards the north end of Wooderson Close would be lost to make way for the expanded stadium.

Loss of housing – policy context

- 4.3 London Plan policy 3.14 makes it clear that the loss of housing, including affordable housing, should be resisted unless the housing is replaced at existing or higher densities with at least equivalent floorspace. Croydon Local Plan (CLP): Strategic Policies policy SP2.2 echoes the London Plan stating that the Council will not permit developments which would result in a net loss of homes or residential land. CLP policy DM1.2 states that there should be no net loss of 3 bedroom homes.

Loss of housing – working towards a solution

- 4.4 At this stage, the Club are still exploring ways in which the design of the extended stadium can be altered to minimise the loss of housing and impacts on residents. It is however clear that some housing would need to be displaced in order to accommodate

the expanded stadium. The Applicant has indicated a willingness to work with the Council to consult with affected occupiers, to identify their housing needs to ensure the occupants are rehoused in accommodation which is appropriate in terms of tenure, size, location and quality.

- 4.5 In addition to the need to rehouse affected tenants, the Applicant is required to ensure there is no net loss of housing floor space or land to the Borough. There is no scope to re-provide the residential land or floorspace which would be lost on site as part of the development. The applicant will therefore be required re-provide equivalent housing off site elsewhere in the Borough. This would be secured by way of a planning obligation (embedded in a S106 legal agreement). The triggers around when this replacement housing would need to be planned and delivered would need to be negotiated – to ensure that re-provision is in place prior to any first occupation of the replacement stand.
- 4.6 The Applicant has been made aware that satisfactory proposals for rehousing affected residents and to ensure no net loss of dwellings or housing land are critical to the success of the scheme.

Loss of car parking

- 4.7 CLP Policy DM31 requires the loss of any car parking to be justified. While no formal details have yet been provided, it is safe to assume that justifying a reduction in car parking will require a modal shift from cars to more sustainable forms of transport. Transportation and travel planning proposals will need to be robust and properly explained any subsequent planning application.

Expansion of the stadium

- 4.8 The importance of professional sporting organisations (including Football Clubs) to London is recognised in London Plan policy 4.6, which provides support for the continued success of professional sporting enterprises and the cultural, social and economic benefits that they offer to residents, workers and visitors.
- 4.9 The presence of a major Football Club within Croydon brings many economic, social and cultural benefits to the Borough. In recognition of this, emerging Local Plan Policy DM21 sets out clear support for Selhurst Park to remain the home stadium of Crystal Palace. The policy goes on to state that the Council will ensure that any redevelopment would enhance the Club's position, with a football stadium which makes a significant contribution to the Borough. Subject to compliance with the other detailed policies in the Development Plan there is no objection in principle to the proposed stadium expansion.
- 4.10 If the proposals introduce additional floor space within the new stadium, which may have a competitive relationship with facilities within existing town centres (e.g. conferencing facilities) the application will need to demonstrate that the proposals will not cause harm to the viability and vitality of the town centres.

Realising the Full Regenerative Benefits of the Development

- 4.11 There is an expectation that this scheme and the extent to which it will significantly respond effectively to the existing and potential fan base of the Club should provide wider benefits to the local area and the local community, in terms of employment and training opportunities (during the construction and end user phases of the

development, supporting sporting initiatives locally and facilitating enhancements to district and local centres within the immediate area, so that the increased capacity and associated well-being of the Club can contribute positively to businesses operating within the neighbouring centres – especially those when supporters will pass through on their way to and from the matches. This will need to be explored further and discussed as part of the planning application process.

The Impact on Highway and Parking Conditions in the Locality

- 4.12 Chapter 4 of the NPPF seeks to promote sustainable transport, noting that planning permissions should not be refused on traffic ground unless impacts are severe. Policy 6.13 of the London Plan indicates that a balance should be struck between promoting development and preventing an excessive parking provision. Policies T8 and T2 of the CLP respectively require development to make appropriate provision for car parking on site and to ensure that traffic generated does not adversely affect the efficiency of nearby roads. Policies SP8.1, SP8.3, SP8.4, SP8.6, SP8.12, SP8.13 and SP8.15 of the Croydon Local Plan: Strategic Policies seek to ensure that sustainable transport will be promoted, that traffic generated by new development can be safely accommodated on the road network and that there is an appropriate level of car parking.
- 4.13 On match days, due to the large number of spectators attending the stadium, all modes of transport to/from the site become severely congested. Given the proposed capacity increase, it will be pivotal to the success scheme that measures are put in place to reduce traffic impacts.
- 4.14 No proposals have yet been put forward by the developer, but the Council expects that sustainable means of transport be promoted through a suite of on and off site measures to achieve the modal shift needed to mitigate impacts.
- 4.15 There is concern that the large area of proposed car parking detracts from the area's sense of place. Additionally, no detail has been provided in terms of how the site will be serviced (and what potential conflicts would exist in terms of fans, cars and coaches, delivery vehicles, media vans etc). It is also currently unclear how pedestrian movements will be facilitated and separated from vehicles (concerns are raised in relation to this shortcoming).
- 4.16 On match days the roads immediately around the site are closed. Advice from the Metropolitan Police suggests that the management of the road closures could be greatly improved and as such, the development should include measures to improve the way in which road closures are managed on match days.

The Appearance of the Development and Impact on the Townscape

- 4.17 London Plan Policies 7.4 and 7.6 states that new development should be complementary to the established local character and that architecture should make a positive contribution to its context. CLP1 Policy SP4.1 states that developments should be of a high quality. Policies UD2 and UD3 of the Croydon Replacement Unitary Development Plan (The Croydon Plan 2006) Saved Policies 2013 require development to be of a high quality and visually appropriate design. Policies UD14 and NC4 place importance on trees and landscaping as an integral part of new developments. There is a clear policy basis for requiring the design and landscaping to be of a high quality.

Massing

- 4.18 The massing is considered broadly acceptable given the local significance of the structure as a landmark building. The applicant has chosen a curved form to reduce the visual on the surrounding area and to reduce the impact on the adjacent residential properties. Whilst this appears to have been reasonably successful, key views demonstrating this approach will need to be submitted and properly assessed.
- 4.19 Concerns are raised in terms of the impact upon the adjacent residential properties along Wooderson Close. Views in this area have been requested to confirm the extent of visual impact.

Design and Appearance.

- 4.20 There is concern that the overall design concept (utilising both “The Crystal Palace” and Eagle motifs) appears to be competing with each other. The Eagle ‘wings’ and the vaulted arched form (reflecting the historic Crystal Palace Exhibition Hall) could well be argued as being tokenistic and not well integrated into the building form and architectural language.
- 4.21 In addition, there is concern that the current external form has too great a corporate appearance, which might well weaken the conceptual motifs. Specifically “The Crystal Palace” motif in particular, which is the preferred aesthetic, requires a lot more development beyond the subtle illusion of its silhouette. This is not to encourage a pastiche, but embedding a modern interpretation of the intricate ironmongery that made the “Palace” iconic into the proposed architectural language and across the full elevation.
- 4.22 In regards to the lower levels, these need to be further developed to relate to the residential context at eye level in terms of both scale, materiality and detailing. This will be key to integrating the expanded stadium into its immediate context at the level experienced by those passing by. It is unclear what materials are being proposed at the ground and first floor level and so further detail is requested. It is also important to determine how best the stand relates to the open spaces to the south – which links back to the future use of this part of the site (in terms of car parking) and any moves to reduce the reliance on on-site car parking, providing more space to allow for fan assembly and gathering before and after the match (as raised below).

Landscape and Placemaking

- 4.23 The scheme appears to lack development of the design in terms of landscaping and place-making design both within the site bounds and beyond it. The following has been suggested that the Applicant:
- Break up the area of car parking as much as possible with soft landscaping.
 - Provide protected routes for pedestrians around and through the car parking
 - Identify opportunities around the site to create an improved public realm offer to the local community in respect to new public spaces, seating and planting.
 - Analyse the key journeys towards the site and enhance these

Hostile Vehicle Mitigation

- 4.24 The design of the expanded stadium has a requirement to integrate any Hostile Vehicle Mitigation measures within the place-making strategy, this must start by researching into precedents of best practice and applying the JASPER methodology: Justifiable, Appropriate, Sustainable, Practical, Affordable, And Reasonable. Integration could include planter, furniture or wayfinding. No details have as yet been provided.

The scheme was reviewed by the Council's Place Review Panel on 18th January 2018 and officers will be able to provide preliminary PRP feedback to the Planning Committee.

Impact on Nearby Occupiers

- 4.25 Policy 7.6 of the London Plan indicates that buildings and structures should not cause unacceptable harm to amenity of surrounding land and buildings. Policy UD8 of the Croydon Plan (2006) Saved Policies 2013 requires the Council to have regard to the privacy and amenity of adjoining occupiers.
- 4.26 The main residential occupiers to be considered are along Holmesdale Road and Clifford Road and Wooderson Close. The privacy, sunlight and daylight and outlook of these occupiers of the adjoining properties must not be significantly adversely affected as the result of the proposed development. Daylight/Sunlight and Micro Climate assessments (e.g. wind impacts) will be required. This will need to be updated with the final proposal and submitted as part of the application.
- 4.27 Outlook and privacy from the properties in Wooderson Close should be given careful consideration and sections through should be submitted with evidence on this matter. No information has yet been submitted, but given the distance from the proposal and the closest properties, the siting of the extended Main Stand may well be considered acceptable.

Other Planning Matters

- 4.28 London Plan policy deals with safety and security and seeks to ensure London is resilient to terrorism (development should include measures to design out crime that, in proportion to the risk, deter terrorism, assist in the detection of terrorist activity and help defer its effects). Safety and security must be intrinsic considerations in the detailed design and layout of expanded stadium and spaces around it. The proposed development should incorporate Secured by Design principles.
- 4.29 London Plan Policy 6.3 seeks Construction Logistics Plans to be secured. London Plan: Policy 7.15 concerns the reduction of noise and enhancement of soundscapes. Policy 7.21 seeks to improve air quality. Croydon Local Plan: Strategic Policy SP6.3 requires development to positively contribute to improving air and water quality by minimising pollution. Policy SP8.5 states that major development proposals will be required to be supported by construction logistic plans.
- 4.30 Given the sites location in the heart of a residential area, it is critical that construction is managed in a way that minimises impacts. A Noise Assessment, Air Quality Assessment, a Construction Environmental Management Plan and a Construction Logistics Plan will need to be provided as part of the application submission.

5 SPECIFIC FEEDBACK REQUESTED

- 5.1 In view of the above, it is suggested that Members focus on the following issues.

- 1) Member expectations in dealing with:
 - The loss of housing (including – in this case - affordable housing);
 - Management of fans moving to and from the game, including management of road closures on match day;
 - Safety, security and resilience to terrorism;
 - Construction logistics and construction management.
- 2) Any concerns over the approach being taken to highway and parking matters;
- 3) The design and appearance of the proposal;
- 4) Impacts of the proposal on neighbouring occupiers and in the wider vicinity of the site.
- 5) Wider regeneration benefits associated with this proposal and associated prioritisation.